Evaluation Analysis Of Policy For Fulfilling The Rights Of Persons With Disabilities In Makassar City

Astuti¹*, Suparman², Suhardiman Syamsu³

¹Government Science Study Program, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Hasanuddin University, Makassar South Sulawesi, Indonesia
²Sociology Study Program, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Hasanuddin University, Makassar South Sulawesi, Indonesia
³Government Science Study Program, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Hasanuddin University, Makassar South Sulawesi, Indonesia

Corresponding Author: Astuti

Government Science Study Program, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Hasanuddin University, Makassar South Sulawesi, Indonesia

Article History
Received: 06 September 2023
Revised: 20 November 2023
Accepted: 26 December 2023

Abstract
Fulfillment of the rights of persons with disabilities is contained in Makassar City Regional Regulation Number 6 of 2013. It contains the fulfillment of the rights to equal opportunities in employment, business and information. In this research, we want to see how the policy for fulfilling the rights to equal opportunities for people with disabilities is evaluated in Makassar City. There are several problems in Makassar City related to fulfilling the rights of people with disabilities, one of which is that access to employment for people with disabilities is still very limited, and also people with disabilities are considered not to be potential workers due to the lack of information received by companies, especially in Makassar City. This research uses a qualitative approach which refers to efforts to study social life through various dimensions of actions and circumstances. Qualitative research is used to capture and reveal facts from research descriptively, starting with an analysis of the policy context to evaluating policies for fulfilling the rights of persons with disabilities in Makassar City, and exploratively, then it will be analyzed from the perspective of the theory of monitoring policy results by William N. Dunn to clearly reveal the government’s policy evaluation regarding the fulfillment of the rights of persons with disabilities. Based on the research process, it can be concluded that the implementation of the policy for fulfilling the rights of persons with disabilities in Makassar City has not run optimally when viewed from four assessment points based on Dunn’s theory, namely compliance, inspection, accounting and explanation. Specifically what is discussed in the theoretical basis is the policy for persons with disabilities which includes the fulfillment of the right to equal opportunities including employment, business and information.
1. Introduction

A policy is formed or made because of a problem that has an impact on the wider community. The government as the holder of power should think about policies that are able to solve problems in society. While policies are not just made straight away, of course there is a strict process from preparation to ratification and even implementation of the policy.

The monitoring stage has four functions in policy analysis according to William N Dunn, namely compliance, inspection, accounting and explanation. The compliance function is useful for determining whether the actions of program administrators, staff, and other actors comply with standards established by legislators or government agencies (Freeman, 2018). Then the Check function helps determine whether resources and services intended for specific target groups or consumers have actually reached them. Furthermore, the accounting function is to produce information that is useful for accounting for social and economic changes that occur after the implementation of a number of policies (Alsharari & Abougamos, 2017). And finally, the explanation function can collect information that can explain why the results of public policies and programs are different.

Within the scope of local government, enforcing the rights of persons with disabilities has become a concern for policy makers. In Makassar City itself, the government's first step in upholding and advancing the rights of persons with disabilities was the issuance of a Regional Regulation (Perda). The Makassar City Government has established a policy in December 2013, namely Makassar City Regional Regulation Number 6 of 2013 concerning Fulfillment of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. Fulfillment of the rights in question includes equal opportunities, accessibility, special protection, the role of society and cooperation and partnerships.

Other elements that have obligations to fulfill the rights of Persons with Disabilities in the city of Makassar are the central government, provincial government, district/city government, community institutions, private companies and community groups, in the form of cooperation and partnerships to achieve the goal of fulfilling the rights of Persons with Disabilities in the city of Makassar.

However, in line with this policy, the fulfillment of the rights of persons with disabilities has not been fully implemented well, this can be seen from the various problems that exist in Makassar City. Based on research from the LEAP Project by Netherlands Leprosy Relief (NLR), the problems being faced in this case are firstly a lack of educational and vocational training opportunities, a lack of self-confidence, and in some cases a lack of family support which also prevents people with disabilities from obtaining the skills needed in the market labor.

Second, related to private and public companies, namely, lack of knowledge and prejudice from the company side, people with disabilities do not have equal access to employment. Although there have been quotas requiring companies to employ people with disabilities since 1997, almost no one is aware of these policies. Even if employers are aware of these policies, they do not know how to “find” people with disabilities and where to hire them. But economic losses are their main worry.

Third, factors related to the role of government, namely, the majority of government policies, programs and services (if any) focus on independent work or separate work, rather than inclusive work. The same attitude is shown by companies, so they increasingly believe that the mismatch between skills and employment opportunities for people with disabilities is indeed difficult to overcome. As a result, people with disabilities are not considered as potential employees, and of course will not obtain permanent employment relationships.

Another problem was also revealed by a study entitled Exploitation of Disabled People as Beggars in the Jl. Veteran, Makassar City, in the research it was said that society still looks down on people with disabilities, even though it is stated in the Constitution which was discussed in the previous discussion that people with disabilities have the same rights as other people, getting the same rights in life. etc. However, in reality, what has been regulated in the law has not been realized optimally. This is due to a lack of attention from the government and society in dealing with this social disability problem.

2. Methods

This research is qualitative where the research carried out has the characteristic of describing an actual situation, but the report is not just a form of report but an event without a scientific interpretation as well as
understanding or gaining an understanding of the phenomena or symptoms that are raised for in-depth research.

**Approaches and Types of Research**
The research approach that the author uses is descriptive. Descriptive research is a research approach that provides an explanation of the problem being investigated by describing the condition of the subject or object of research by explaining the position and relationship between variables based on visible facts or as they really are. Meanwhile, the type of research used is a case study, where a case study is research about the status of research subjects relating to a specific (typical) stage of the whole personality. This type of case study research is a study that will involve in-depth investigation and thorough examination of the background or conditions of certain individuals, groups or communities with the aim of providing a complete picture of the subject.

**Data Collection**
The data collected in this research is based on primary data and secondary data. Primary data was obtained from field research, including interviews and documentation relating to the fulfillment of the rights of people with disabilities in Makassar City. An interview is a conversation process with the aim of constructing information about people, events, activities, organizations, motivations, feelings and so on, which is carried out by two parties, namely the interviewer who asks questions to the interviewee who provides answers to the questions. Interviews can also be conducted in private using a questionnaire instrument. Observation is observation and recording carried out systematically on symptoms that appear on the research object. Observation activities are essentially observation activities using the five senses to obtain information. Observations and recording are carried out on research objects, regarding natural behavior, visible dynamics, description of behavior according to the existing situation and so on. There are four types of tools used to make observations, namely anecdotal records to record events that apply to a particular case; check list sheet (✓) according to the aspects observed; rating scale sheets are used to collect data with the aim of explaining, classifying and assessing a person or certain situation; Mechanical devices are tools that contain technological elements such as cell phones, cameras, video recorders and so on. The data obtained is in the form of check lists, rating scales, images, photos or videos which are then processed into a narrative or description of the research object being studied.

**Data Analysis Technique**
The case data analysis technique is carried out in three stages, namely data reduction, data presentation and conclusion/verification.

Data reduction stage: Data reduction is carried out in two stages, namely the first at the stage of preparing the research design by determining the conceptual framework, research questions, cases and research instruments used. Second, after the field data has been collected by summarizing, formulating themes, grouping and presenting the data in writing.

Conclusion and verification stage. At this stage the researcher carries out interpretation, determining the meaning of the data presented. To solve this, the researcher used tactics (1) paying attention to patterns and themes, (2) clustering, (3) making metaphors, (4) sorting variables, (5) classifying small things into more general things, (6) determining factors, (7) paying attention to the relationship between variables.

3. **Results and Discussion**

**Compliance**
Monitoring is useful for determining whether the actions of program administrators, staff, and other actors comply with standards and procedures established by legislators, government agencies, and professional institutions (Abbott & Snidal, 2021). At the point of compliance, the important thing in the evaluation process is the actors involved in implementing a policy. Policy implementers should know the purpose of policy evaluation, policy implementers must also be firm in policy implementation procedures, and must also ensure that policy implementation is in accordance with the content of the policy. The implementer of the policy for fulfilling the rights of persons with disabilities in Makassar City is the Social Service which then collaborates with organizations related to persons with disabilities. At the wirajaya center, people with disabilities will receive work skills training for several months and then after the training is complete they can register for jobs in companies in the city of Makassar. Then the government also provides services to people with disabilities in getting jobs, namely through the Disability Services Unit.
which was formed by the employment service as a liaison between people with disabilities and companies in the city of Makassar.

Social service for people with disabilities are only emergency services, they do not intervene for people with disabilities who are in social rehabilitation places (Zikl et al., 2022). And they also focus on neglected people with disabilities. Even if there is a request for rehabilitation, the social services will consider this according to the level of importance, this is because the social services have limitations in carrying out the program. The government's role in supporting people with disabilities to set up businesses is still limited. Because there are indeed obstacles for the social service in carrying out activities. The activities expected or conveyed by disabled people's organizations cannot all be carried out by the Social Service, the Social Service must adjust to the existing quota and of course the ones that are most urgent must be implemented. The solution to the budget limitations means that the social services department must provide assistance in turns to fulfill requests from organizations (Elmore, 2014). In conditions like this, the role of KDD as a supervisory institution must ensure that the government fulfills the rights of people with disabilities, especially the government's role in supporting people with disabilities to set up their own businesses. However, at the beginning of its formation, KDD was immediately faced with problems, namely Covid-19, where it was difficult for them to hold direct meetings due to government restrictions. This is considered a problem because KDD itself does not yet have a concept for carrying out its supervision.

In fulfilling the rights of people with disabilities to obtain information, the government communicates a lot with organizations of people with disabilities to then provide opportunities for people with disabilities to voice their opinions. So the government itself opened a discussion space for people with disabilities to express their aspirations, and this was well received. The government then has direction or information regarding the needs of people with disabilities which can then be considered to realize the aspirations of people with disabilities (Hammel et al., 2008). Moreover, this organization of people with disabilities is protected by law.

Examination
Monitoring helps determine whether resources and services intended for specific target groups or consumers (individuals, families, cities, states, regions) are actually reaching them. The self-examination will explain whether the policies implemented are on target or not in accordance with the initial plan. The inspection also seeks to explain that the distribution of needs has reached the target object in accordance with the contents of the policy. And of course the inspection will explain what has been realized from the agreed policies for the intended object.

In the field of employment itself, as in the previous point, the social services work with wirajaya centers, there people with disabilities receive skills training so that they can then get a job after completing their training. Persons with disabilities at the Wirajaya Center have received approval from the social services to receive training. Then, after their files are entered at the Wirajaya Food Center, they will immediately be processed according to the needs and interests of the disabled person, then after the training is complete, they must return to the social service to report that the training period has been completed. At Wirajaya centers, there is not only assistance in the form of skills training, but also tools are provided according to the needs of people with disabilities themselves.

Then, in the policy on fulfilling the rights of persons with disabilities, article 19 paragraph 1, it is emphasized that every person with a disability has the same opportunity to get a job according to the type and degree of disability, including becoming a civil servant (PNS). Like the 2023 CPNS recruitment, there are several special quotas for people with disabilities. Then in article 19 paragraph 2 it is also emphasized that every private company that has a workforce of at least 100 (one hundred) people and uses high technology is obliged to employ at least 1 (one) disabled person who meets the position requirements and job qualifications. The government is also taking steps to fulfill employment for people with disabilities with the existence of a Disability Services Unit (ULD) which was formed by the employment service (Cook, 2006). One of ULD's tasks is to connect people with disabilities who really want to work with companies in Makassar City in particular. ULD is then expected to provide knowledge support for companies or support by providing knowledge on how to employ people with disabilities because it is definitely different from those who are not people with disabilities.

HWDI also collaborates with the ULD to create programs and monitor them so that they run in accordance with the initial formation of the ULD itself. This was done to encourage companies to open employment spaces for people with disabilities. One of the programs that was then presented by disabled people's organizations with ULD was holding a discussion room with HRD of companies in Makassar City. From the available information, the program run by the employment service in collaboration with organizations of
people with disabilities is to discuss policies created to provide opportunities for people with disabilities to work in private companies in Makassar City. However, it turned out that the company representatives present, namely HRD, did not know that companies were required to employ 1% of their employees with disabilities. This fact then becomes a new job for the government, be it ULD or KDD, to carry out outreach regarding the rule that 1% of a company's employees must be people with disabilities. It is not only the government's duty, but also communities of people with disabilities also have the right to convey these regulations to parties who are related to these regulations. However, after holding a meeting with HRD related to the socialization of regulations for private companies, this does not mean that the policy will be immediately implemented by the companies present at the socialization, this is because HRD must convey it first to the superior or head of the company and decide what steps to take. On the other hand, they must again encourage company leaders to ensure that every recruitment of their employees must involve people with disabilities in accordance with the current regulations.

Then, what is related to the opportunity for people with disabilities to build their own businesses is also one of the rights that people with disabilities have, meaning that they should not be prohibited from building or starting their own businesses. The role of disabled people's organizations in supporting disabled people who want to open a business is only limited to being an intermediary for disabled people regarding their obstacles in starting a business. Because the biggest responsibility lies with the government. Based on the results of interviews with disabled people's organizations and the government, so far they have helped people with disabilities to build businesses through skills training and some have been facilitated in the form of tools that support the running of the business, but not all of them have received capital assistance because there are also those who have to provide their own capital to build business. So, assistance in the form of capital from the government for people with disabilities is not yet comprehensive. Most of the people with disabilities who want to open a business have to provide their own capital, and indeed the obstacles they experience will be assisted by disabled people's organizations and then conveyed to the government.

Then, they can get access to information for people with disabilities in organizations for people with disabilities because currently there are many organizations for people with disabilities in Makassar City. The organizations for people with disabilities in Makassar City are as follows:

**National Paralympic Committee (NPC)**
Disability organization specifically in the field of sports and development of sports achievements for people with disabilities in South Sulawesi and indeed also has a national organization based in Solo.

**Indonesian Association of Persons with Disabilities (PPDI)**
PPDI is an advocacy organization for the rights of people with disabilities, its members and administrators are men and women with disabilities from all types of disabilities, and PPDI also has a national level organization in Jakarta.

**Indonesian Association of Physically Disabled People (PPDFI)**
This organization is specifically for people with physical disabilities, both men and women, whose central organization is in Jakarta.

**Indonesian Blind Association (Pertuni)**
This organization is the first disability organization to be formed at the national level, and it is specifically for blind men and women and also the central organization is in Jakarta.

**Indonesian Deaf Welfare Movement (Gerkatin)**
This organization also has a central organization in Jakarta.

**Indonesian Association of Disabled Women (HWDI)**
HWDI is the newest and youngest mainstream organization because it was founded in 1997 and also has a central organization in Jakarta, but only specifically for women.

The organization above is a national organization which then formed an organization at the regional level such as in Makassar City. The organization at the regional level is the Indonesian Disabled Movement for Equality (PerDIK). Apart from organizations for people with disabilities, there have also been associations formed for parents of people with disabilities, namely the Down Syndrome Children's Community (KOADS) and the Makassar Association of Parents of Autistic Children (POAAM). So there are indeed many organizations that can accommodate people with disabilities in obtaining their rights, one of which is access.
to information. Because disabled people's organizations will continue to voice the rights of people with disabilities.

**Accounting**
Monitoring produces information that is useful for accounting for social and economic changes that occur after the implementation of a number of public policies from time to time. The accounting function will also display existing data in the implementation of the policy and then explain what happens after the implementation of a policy.

As previously explained, the Social Service is collaborating with the Wirajaya Center as a place for social rehabilitation, especially for people with disabilities, to then gain skills to work in a company or to set up a business. At the Wirajaya Center, not only skills training can be obtained by people with disabilities but also physical assistance in the form of wheelchairs, canes, and so on.

There are 1,381 people with disabilities trained at the Wirajaya Center, and the largest number of people with physical disabilities among other types of disabilities. Where assistance is provided not only within the Wirajaya Center but also assistance is provided to people with disabilities in their immediate community or in their families. Based on this data, it can be seen that the number of mentors provided in the community or family is greater than those who receive direct assistance at the Wirajaya Center. There are more women than men. From this data it can be seen that more people with disabilities need material assistance than skills assistance or job training. As we can see in the data, people with physical disabilities who received material assistance reached 1134, while the number who took part in job training only reached 64 people with physical disabilities. Likewise, more people with disabilities who are blind and deaf also receive material assistance rather than job training.

Data from the Wirajaya Center cannot be compared with data on people with disabilities in Makassar City. With this data, it cannot be concluded how far this policy has progressed based on data because data on people with disabilities in Makassar City as a whole cannot yet be identified. The most important data in this research is of course data on people with disabilities in Makassar City. However, the overall data cannot yet be displayed because the government does not yet have real data. The absence of this data also becomes an obstacle in determining how to determine the development of policy implementation for persons with disabilities. Regarding people with disabilities who have had the opportunity to work in companies in Makassar City, there is also no supporting data. Like people with disabilities who have worked in private companies in Makassar City for which there is no data, people with disabilities who have opened or established businesses cannot be fully identified. Once again, this is because there is no data on people with disabilities held by the government, especially in Makassar City, so data collection for people with disabilities who set up their own businesses cannot be identified properly. Important needs for people with disabilities are also difficult to identify, and it will be difficult to provide assistance that truly suits their needs with the facilities provided by the government. In fact, to provide assistance, data on people with disabilities is very important, because their needs are very different, even though the type of disability is the same, their needs must be adjusted to each person. This then concerns their comfort in their activities. So, in analyzing the level of welfare, both from social and economic perspectives, this cannot be explained yet, because the initial data that should be used as a comparison from time to time does not yet exist. This includes data regarding the number of people with disabilities who have set up businesses, who have received assistance from the government and so on.

For your own information, people with disabilities cannot fully access full information regarding which companies have opened job opportunities for people with disabilities to become employees at that company. People with disabilities will be greatly helped if the data in question already exists and can be accessed. For example, if there is already a list of companies that accept people with disabilities as employees, what will be done is of course to improve skills based on the company's identified needs. It will be easier for people with disabilities to get jobs or the opportunity to open a business if they can access clear data from the government.

**Explanation**
Explanation is more about gathering information that can explain why the results of public policies and programs are different. In this monitoring, it will be explained that policy implementation in the field is different from the content of the policy, whether a policy has not been achieved, there are still policies that have not been implemented, and policies that have not been implemented ideally.

The policy of fulfilling the rights of persons with disabilities is not entirely the responsibility of social services in its implementation. Many parties must be involved in implementing this policy. It can even be
said that the social service itself has not focused its attention too much on the policy of fulfilling the rights of persons with disabilities. Social services have not fully paid attention to the policy of fulfilling the rights of persons with disabilities. In the field of employment, social services do not play a major role in its implementation. So matters related to employment are indeed handed over to the employment service to then maximize the implementation of policies.

In the employment department itself, a Disability Services Unit (ULD) was formed. One of ULD's tasks is to become an intermediary or liaison for people with disabilities and companies in Makassar City. One of the rules socialized by ULD and in collaboration with organizations of people with disabilities is that private companies are required to provide employment opportunities for people with disabilities 1% of the number of employees they have. Implementation of policies in the field appears to have not been carried out well because there is still a lack of socialization regarding existing policies. This regulation needs to continue to be socialized to companies in Makassar City, so that they can fulfill their obligations to provide employment opportunities for people with disabilities. The supervision carried out on policies for persons with disabilities has not been optimal. The government only formed the Regional Commission for Disabilities as a policy monitoring institution for persons with disabilities in 2019, while this policy was passed in 2013. This has caused the slow implementation of supervision. The formation of KDD in 2019 was not free from problems. At the start of its formation, KDD had to follow government regulations regarding breaking the chain of the Covid-19 disease.

It is very important to discuss the supervision program because KDD must create a formula for the supervision that will be carried out so that the results are maximum. KDD also does not have references for the same form of supervision from other regions regarding monitoring policies for fulfilling the rights of persons with disabilities. The obstacles faced by KDD at that time meant that they had to discuss via online media as a solution. However, despite these constraints, KDD still continues to carry out its duties, they continue to hold online meetings or discussions to discuss the tasks that will be carried out in the future.

Then the opportunity for people with disabilities to build a business has indeed received assistance from the government, but in general the assistance is in the form of skills training. It can be said that assistance in the form of capital is still minimal.

Then, when this policy continued to be implemented, which was also accompanied by KDD as a supervisory institution, it was acknowledged that the implementation of this policy was still relatively slow. This is because there are situations that become obstacles in maximizing the implementation of policies. The obstacles faced are a limited budget, then other issues that are more priority. In implementing a policy, it must be supported by various things, including the budget and the focus of specific issues in implementing the policy. This is what causes the minimal capital assistance provided by the government for people with disabilities who want to set up a business. Currently, KDD supervision focuses more on policies in the education sector. So it is true that the supervision carried out so far by KDD does not cover all policy content, meaning that the focus starts from issues that are deemed to need to be prioritized in its implementation. This of course cannot be separated from the KDD process itself, KDD needs to improve, there are still many things related to supervision that must be resolved first, from how to carry out good supervision to the right program to be implemented that is pro-disabled..

The implementation of this policy has not been implemented optimally due to the lack of disability data. This is one of the biggest factors in policy implementation not going well. Data on people with disabilities is very necessary to be able to measure the extent to which policies have been implemented. In providing assistance, disability data is very necessary, identification of people with disabilities must be clear to be able to provide assistance. Because the needs of each person with a disability will be different even if it is the same type of disability. The absence of data can also result in aid not being distributed properly to people with disabilities. There are also no data collection problems in employment. For example, data on companies that have provided opportunities for people with disabilities to work, as well as data for people with disabilities who have their own businesses. The data collection on persons with disabilities had already been scheduled by Bappenas but due to inadequate budget constraints, the data collection was not carried out until now. Because collecting data on people with disabilities is not easy because there are various kinds of disabilities and also many sub-variations. Data collection on people with disabilities must also be well-resourced and understand the various types of disabilities so that the data produced will be accurate and of course will be very useful for programs that will be carried out in the future.
4. Conclusion

The government has implemented a policy of fulfilling the rights of persons with disabilities in Makassar City. There are several government strategies in implementing this policy, in this case social services. One strategy is that the social service collaborates with the Wirajaya Center, which is a social rehabilitation center under the supervision of the Ministry of Social Affairs. At Wirajaya centers, people with disabilities can then get skills training both to work in companies and to build their own businesses. Then the Makassar City government also formed a supervisory institution for the implementation of policies to fulfill the rights of persons with disabilities. The Regional Commission for Disabilities (KDD) was formed by the government in 2019 to ensure that the policy was implemented in accordance with its contents.

In fulfilling the rights of persons with disabilities in the field of employment, the government provides opportunities for persons with disabilities to be in social rehabilitation centers to obtain and train skills for work. The government, through the employment department, has also formed a Disability Services Unit (ULD) which is a liaison between companies and people with disabilities who need work. Then for people with disabilities who want to build their own businesses, the government has not been able to help much in terms of capital. People with disabilities are still required to work on their own in building businesses which will then be assisted by organizations of people with disabilities regarding issues that are important to voice.

Because the delivery of information is usually through organizations of people with disabilities, this organization then becomes a forum for conveying their aspirations.

The government's achievements in implementing this policy of fulfilling the rights of persons with disabilities cannot be clearly measured using numerical percentages. This is because data on people with disabilities in Makassar City does not yet exist. The percentage of people with disabilities who have experienced the policy cannot be ascertained. The absence of this data also makes it difficult for the Regional Commission for Disabilities (KDD) to supervise this policy. This data is also important in terms of collecting data on people with disabilities who have had the opportunity to work, as well as to record which companies have opened up opportunities for people with disabilities to work. It is also very important for the delivery of information to be based on data because to provide assistance to people with disabilities, clear data is needed because the needs of each person with a disability are different.

The implementation of policies to fulfill the rights of persons with disabilities has indeed been implemented, but has not been optimal. There are several obstacles faced in implementing this policy. Firstly, the social service has not yet determined targets for achieving this policy and the social service has not fully focused on the policy of fulfilling the rights of persons with disabilities. Furthermore, few people know about the rules in this policy, especially companies in Makassar City. One of the important rules is that 1% of the number of employees in the company must be given to people with disabilities, but there are still many who don't know this rule. The next obstacle is that the supervisory institution, namely KDD, was only formed in 2019. KDD then had to formulate a supervisory strategy from scratch, and they also had no references from other regions related to monitoring policies for fulfilling the rights of persons with disabilities. Currently, KDD is still focused on supervision in the education sector, not yet comprehensive in terms of policy content. The biggest obstacle is data, where comprehensive data on people with disabilities in Makassar City does not yet exist, this has hampered the maximum implementation of policies.

References


Available online at: https://jazindia.com